



REPORT TO THE PRESIDENT ON

FEDERAL ENERGY RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

FOR THE

CHALLENGES OF THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

PRESIDENT'S COMMITTEE OF ADVISORS ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

PANEL ON ENERGY RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

NOVEMBER 1997

About the President's Committee of Advisors on Science and Technology

President Clinton established the President's Committee of Advisors on Science and Technology (PCAST) by Executive Order 12882 at the same time that he established the National Science and Technology Council (NSTC). The PCAST serves as the highest level private sector science and technology advisory group for the President and the NSTC. The Committee members are distinguished individuals appointed by the President, and are drawn from industry, education and research institutions, and other non-governmental organizations. The Assistant to the President for Science and Technology co-chairs the Committee with a private sector member selected by the President.

The formal link between the PCAST and the NSTC ensures that national needs remain an overarching guide for the NSTC. The PCAST provides feedback about Federal programs and actively advises the NSTC about science and technology issues of national importance.

Gene Carl Feldman, NASA, created the cover from a Mosaic satellite image "The Earth at Night" (© 1985) compiled by W.T. Sullivan, III, University of Washington, from satellite photographs made by the Defense Meteorological Satellite Program of the U.S. Air Force. Feldman converted the original black and white photograph from a Mercator Projection of the Earth into two orthographic projections. The lights depict sources of CO₂ emissions: lights of cities; forest and agricultural fires; and natural gas flares. These also suggest the global importance of energy, the focus of this study.

THE PRESIDENT'S COMMITTEE OF ADVISORS ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

Chairs

John H. Gibbons

Assistant to the President for Science and Technology
Director, Office of Science and Technology Policy

John Young

Former President and CEO
Hewlett-Packard Co.

Members

Norman R. Augustine

Chairman of the Board
Lockheed Martin Corporation

Francisco J. Ayala

Donald Bren Professor of Biological Sciences
Professor of Philosophy
University of California, Irvine

Murray Gell-Mann

Professor, Santa Fe Institute
R.A. Millikan Professor Emeritus of
Theoretical Physics
California Institute of Technology

David A. Hamburg

President Emeritus
Carnegie Corporation of New York

John P. Holdren

Teresa and John Heinz Professor
of Environmental Policy
John F. Kennedy School of Government
Harvard University

Diana MacArthur

Chair and CEO
Dynamac Corporation

Shirley M. Malcolm

Head, Directorate for Education and
Human Resources Programs
American Association for the Advancement
of Science

Mario J. Molina

Institute Professor
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Peter H. Raven

Director, Missouri Botanical Garden
Engelmann Professor of Botany
Washington University in St. Louis

Sally K. Ride

Director, California Space Institute
Professor of Physics
University of California, San Diego

Judith Rodin

President
University of Pennsylvania

Charles A. Sanders

Former Chairman
Glaxo-Wellcome Inc.

David E. Shaw

Chairman
D.E. Shaw & Co. and Juno Online Services

Charles M. Vest

President
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Virginia V. Weldon

Senior Vice President for Public Policy
Monsanto Company

Lilian Shiao-Yen Wu

Member, Research Staff
Thomas J. Watson Research Center
IBM

Executive Secretary

Angela Phillips Diaz

**THE PRESIDENT'S COMMITTEE OF ADVISORS ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY
ENERGY RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT PANEL**

John P. Holdren (Chairman)

Teresa and John Heinz Professor of Environmental Policy
Harvard University

John Ahearne

Adjunct Professor of Civil and
Environmental Engineering, and
Lecturer in Public Policy
Duke University, and
Director, Sigma Xi Center

Richard Balzhiser

President Emeritus
Electric Power Research Institute

Joan T. Bok

Chairman of the Board
New England Electric System

Robert W. Conn

Dean, School of Engineering
University of California,
San Diego

William L. Fisher

Barrow Chair
Department of Geological Sciences
University of Texas at Austin

Thomas L. Fisher

Chairman, President and CEO
NICOR, Inc., and
Northern Illinois Gas

Robert A. Frosch

BCSIA
John F. Kennedy School of
Government
Harvard University

William Fulkerson

Senior Fellow, Joint Institute for
Energy and Environment
University of Tennessee
Former Associate Director
Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Hal Harvey

Executive Director
The Energy Foundation

Daniel A. Lashof

Senior Scientist
Natural Resources Defense
Council

Diana MacArthur

Chair and CEO
Dynamac Corporation

Lawrence T. Papay

Senior Vice President and
General Manager
Technology and Consulting
Bechtel Corporation

Donald L. Paul

Vice President for Technology
and Environmental Affairs
Chevron Corporation

Maxine Savitz

General Manager
AlliedSignal Ceramic
Components

Laura Tyson

Class of 1939 Professor of
Economics and Business
Administration
University of California,
Berkeley

Charles M. Vest

President
Massachusetts Institute
of Technology

Virginia V. Weldon, M.D.

Senior Vice President,
Public Policy
Monsanto Company

Robert H. Williams

Senior Research Scientist
Center for Energy and
Environmental Studies
Princeton University

Lilian Shiao-Yen Wu

Member, Research Staff
Thomas J. Watson Research Center
IBM

John Young

Former President and CEO
Hewlett-Packard Co.

Panel Associates

Brian C. Elliott¹

Vice President
Northern Illinois Gas

Jefferson W. Tester²

H P. Meissner Professor of
Chemical Engineering, and
Director, Energy Laboratory
Massachusetts Institute
of Technology

Study Executive Director

Samuel F. Baldwin

National Science and
Technology Council
Agency Representative

¹ Deputy to Thomas L. Fisher.

² Deputy to Charles Vest.

Staff

James T. Bartis
RAND Corporation

Mark Bernstein
Office of Science and Technology Policy

Ellison Burton
Dynamac Corporation

Paul de Sa
Harvard University

Miriam Forman
National Science and Technology Council
Agency Representative

Beverly Hartline
Office of Science and Technology Policy

Rod Judkins
Oak Ridge National Laboratory

David Pelly
Harvard University

Susan Resetar
RAND Corporation

Ambuj Sagar
Harvard University

Administrative Staff

Nikki Kelly
National Renewable Energy Laboratory

Cluster Myers
National Renewable Energy Laboratory

This was a Panel of twenty-one persons of diverse backgrounds and viewpoints, tackling an immensely complex subject. Inevitably, not every member of the Panel is entirely happy with every formulation in the report. But we are unanimous that the main messages and overall balance in this joint product are correct and appropriate.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	ES- 1
Synopsis of Main Recommendations	ES- 2
Rationale for the Recommendations	ES- 7
Elaboration of Findings and Recommendations	ES-14
Concluding Observations and One More Recommendation	ES-30
1. Energy Challenges and Opportunities	1- 1
U.S. and World Energy Supply and Demand	1- 4
Economic Challenges in Our Energy Future	1- 7
Environmental Challenges in Our Energy Future	1- 9
National Security Challenges in Our Energy Future	1-14
The Leverage of Energy R&D Against the Challenges	1-16
References	1-21
2. The Role of R&D and the Changing R&D Paradigm	2- 1
Rationales for R&D Activities	2- 1
A Picture of Energy R&D	2- 3
Explanations for Recent Trends in U.S. R&D	2-15
Judging the Adequacy of R&D Efforts	2-20
References	2-23
3. Energy Efficiency	3- 1
Motivation and Context	3- 1
Findings and Recommendations	3- 9
The Building Sector	3- 9
The Industry Sector	3-15
The Transportation Sector	3-20
Budget Recommendations	3-26
References	3-32
4. Fossil Energy	4- 1
Motivation and Context	4- 1
Findings, Evaluations, Initiatives, and Recommendations	4- 3
Demonstration and Commercialization Issues	4-19
Energy and Environmental Impact	4-21
Crosscuts	4-22
References	4-27

5. Nuclear Energy: Fission and Fusion	5- 1
Context	5- 2
Evaluation of R&D Portfolio	5- 5
Policy Issues	5-17
Potential Contributions	5-21
References	5-24
6. Renewable Energy	6- 1
Motivation and Context	6- 2
Market Development	6- 4
International Context	6- 5
Federal Role	6- 6
Budget Recommendations and Potential Impacts of the R&D	6- 7
Renewable Energy Technologies, R&D Needs, and Opportunities	6-12
Conclusion	6-43
References	6-44
7. Crosscutting Issues and Synthesis	7- 1
Portfolio Assessment	7- 1
Commercialization Issues	7-14
International Issues	7-21
R&D Management Issues	7-24
Concluding Observations and One Final Recommendation	7-32
References	7-34
Acknowledgements	A-1
Units and Conversion Factors	B-1

TABLES

Executive Summary

ES.1: Recommended DOE Budget Authority for Applied Energy-Technology R&D.	ES- 3
ES.2: Relation of Applied Energy Technology R&D to “Total Energy R&D”.	ES- 4
ES.3: Recommended DOE Applied Energy-Technology R&D Initiatives and Budget Authority.	ES-32

1. Energy Challenges and Opportunities

1.1: World and U.S. Energy Supply, 1995.	1- 4
1.2: World and U.S. Electricity Supply, 1995.	1- 4
1.3: Energy End-Uses in the United States, Mid-1990s.	1- 5
1.4: Annual Rates of Improvement in Energy-Technology Performance.	1-18
1.5: Turnover Times for Energy Supply and End-Use Technologies.	1-19
1.6: Projected Rates of Technical Improvement in Recent CO ₂ Studies.	1-20

2. The Role of R&D and the Changing R&D Paradigm

2.1: DOE Energy-Technology Budget Authority, FY 1997.	2- 8
2.2: Energy-Technology R&D in the Other G-7 Countries, 1985 and 1995.	2- 9
2.3: Strategic Criteria for Energy R&D.	2-22

3. Energy Efficiency

3.1: Organization of R&D Programs.	3- 14
3.2: Major Program Strategies.	3- 16
3.3: Summary of DOE Transportation Programs.	3- 22
3.4: Potential Benefits from Energy Efficiency Technologies.	3- 28
3.5: Budget Summaries for Energy Efficiency R&D—Buildings.	3- 29
3.6: Budget Summaries for Energy Efficiency R&D—Industry.	3- 30
3.7: Budget Summaries for Energy Efficiency R&D—Transportation.	3- 31
3.8: Budget Summary.	

4. Fossil Energy

4.1: PCAST Proposed Five-Year (1999-2003) Fossil Energy R&D Budget.	4- 4
4.2: DOE Fossil Energy R&D Program: Costs and Impacts on Carbon Emissions Rates and Oil and Gas Production.	4-24
4.3: Potential CO ₂ Emissions Reductions from Advanced Coal and Gas Power Systems.	4-26

5. Nuclear Energy: Fission and Fusion

5.1: R&D Investments of DOE’s Office of Nuclear Energy.	5- 8
5.2: Recommended DOE Investments in Fission and Fusion Energy R&D.	5-17

6. Renewable Energy

6.1: Proposed R&D Budgets and Activities.	6- 9
6.2: Potential Impacts of Selected RETs in Relation to R&D Activity.	6-11

FIGURES

Executive Summary

- ES.1: Potential reduction of U.S. oil imports by selected advanced technologies. ES-26
ES.2: Schematic portrayal of R&D portfolio analysis of carbon-reduction potential. ES-27

1. Energy Challenges and Opportunities

- 1.1: World primary energy supply from 1850 to 1995. 1- 6
1.2: Past and projected U.S. oil imports, 1950 to 2015. 1- 8

2. The Role of R&D and the Changing R&D Paradigm

- 2.1: Total U.S. R&D expenditure by source of funds, 1970 to 1995. 2- 3
2.2: Trends in Federal nondefense R&D by budget function, 1960 to 1997. 2- 4
2.3: DOE FY 1997 appropriation by business line. 2- 5
2.4: U.S. global change scientific research by agency, 1990 to 1997. 2- 6
2.5: Budget authority for DOE programs that support basic, crosscutting, and environmental research, 1978 to 1997. 2- 7
2.6: Budget authority for DOE energy technology R&D, 1978 to 1997. 2- 9
2.7: Energy technology R&D budget authority of DOE and predecessor agencies, 1966 to 1997. 2- 9
2.8: Japanese government energy R&D budget, 1978 to 1995. 2-10
2.9: EPRI and GRI revenues, 1985 to 1996. 2-12
2.10: Historical crude oil prices (West Texas Intermediate). 2-16

3. Energy Efficiency

- 3.1: Energy intensity of the U.S. economy, 1970-1996. 3- 2
3.2: Actual and projected U.S. carbon emissions. 3- 2
3.3: Energy efficiency potential. 3- 3
3.4: Percentage of consumption by end-use in buildings, 1995. 3- 4
3.5: Percentage of primary energy used in the manufacturing sector by major industrial category, 1994. 3- 4
3.6: Fuel used in the U.S. transportation sector, 1996. 3- 5
3.7: Carbon emission projections by alternative studies. 3-27

4. Fossil Energy

- 4.1: The Vision 21 Plant. 4- 5
4.2: The oil and gas resource cycle and public/private roles. 4-12
4.3: The natural gas to liquids process. 4-13

5. Nuclear Energy: Fission and Fusion

- 5.1: Growth of annual nuclear power generation in selected countries, 1973-1994. 5- 4
- 5.2: Funding history for fission power R&D and fusion energy. 5- 6
- 5.3: Projected U.S. nuclear generating capacity. 5-19
- 5.4: Carbon intensities of primary energy expressed in tons of carbon per ton of oil equivalent energy. 5-22

7. Crosscutting Issues and Synthesis

- 7.1: Schematic diagram of leverage of energy R&D against carbon emissions. 7- 5
- 7.2: Carbon emissions for various electricity generation options. 7- 6
- 7.3: Narrowing the oil import gap. 7- 8
- 7.4: Fundamental and applied energy R&D in the FY 1997 budget. 7-10
- 7.5: The “Mountain of Death” and “The Valley of Death” associated with the technological innovation process. 7-15

BOXES

Executive Summary

- 1.1: The UN Framework Convention on Climate Change 1-11
- 1.2: IPCC Emissions Scenarios and Their Implications 1-12

2. The Role of R&D and the Changing R&D Paradigm

- 2.1: The U.S. Global Change Research Program. 2- 6
- 2.2: Energy R&D in Japan. 2-10
- 2.3: Collaborative R&D—Its Role in a More Efficient and Sophisticated Global Marketplace. 2-14
- 2.4: The Clinch River Breeder Reactor Project: A Government/Industry Failure. 2-17

3. Energy Efficiency

- 3.1: Natural Gas and Efficiency Opportunities. 3- 7
- 3.2: Materials Compatibility and Lubricant Research: A Government/Industry Success Story. 3- 8
- 3.3: Efficient Windows—A Technological Success. 3-10
- 3.4: “Best-Practice” Home of the Year 2020. 3-11
- 3.5: Oxy-Fuel Firing—A Government/Industry Success. 3-15
- 3.6: Advanced Process Controls for Industry. 3-17
- 3.7: *Zymomonas mobilis*—An R&D Success. 3-20
- 3.8: Transportation Technology for the Future—Fuel Cells. 3-21

4. Fossil Energy

- 4.1: Coal as a Strategic Resource. 4- 6
- 4.2: The Cool Water Integrated Coal Gasifier Combined Cycle Plant: A Model for Government/Industry Collaboration. 4- 7
- 4.3: Natural Gas as the Transition Fuel. 4- 9
- 4.4: Secondary Gas Recovery: A Government/Industry Success Story. 4-11
- 4.5: Oil Security Requires a Transportation Fuels R&D Strategy. 4-18

6. Renewable Energy

- 6.1: A Vision for Wind Energy. 6-14
- 6.2: A Vision for Photovoltaic Electricity. 6-17
- 6.3: A Vision for Energy and Urban Infrastructure: The National Advanced Drilling and Excavation Technology (NADET) Program. 6-23
- 6.4: Wires—Society’s Lifeline. 6-26
- 6.5: Alternative Ways to Use 5 ExaJoules of Biomass per Year—A Thought Experiment. 6-31

7. Crosscutting Issues and Synthesis

- 7.1: The Importance of Track Records. 7-13
- 7.2: Lessons Learned From the Recent History of U.S. Energy R&D. 7-13
- 7.3: Pasteur’s Quadrant. 7-16

